Statistical Challenges in Assessing and Fostering the Reproducibility of Scientific Results:
A Workshop

February 26-27, 2015

National Academy of Sciences Building
2101 Constitution Ave NW
Washington, DC
NAS Lecture Room

Webinar link: http://sites.nationalacademies.org/DEPS/BMSA/DEPS_153236

Meeting Objectives

Address statistical challenges in assessing and fostering the reproducibility of scientific results by examining three issues from a statistical perspective: the extent of reproducibility, the causes of reproducibility failures, and potential remedies.

Specifically:

- What are appropriate metrics and study designs that can be used to quantify reproducibility of scientific results?
  - Variability across studies is a well-known phenomenon and has given rise to the field of research synthesis and meta-analysis. How should this variability be assessed? What degree of variability would lead to concerns about lack of reproducibility?
- How can the choice of statistical methods for study design and analysis affect the reproducibility of a scientific result?
  - How does routine statistical hypothesis testing with widely used thresholds for test significance affect the reproducibility of results? How do standard methods for study design and choice of sample size affect reproducibility?
- Are there analytical and infrastructural approaches that can enhance reproducibility, within disciplines and overall?
  - Do we need new conceptual/theoretical frameworks for assessing the strength of evidence from a study? Do we need broad adoption of practices for making study protocols and study data available to the scientific community? How can this be achieved?
Thursday, February 26

Session I - Overview and Case Studies

8:30am  Introductions from the Workshop Co-Chairs
        • Constantine Gatsonis, Brown University
        • Giovanni Parmigiani, Dana Farber Cancer Institute

8:45am  Perspectives from Stakeholders
        • Lawrence Tabak, National Institutes of Health
        • Irene Qualters, National Science Foundation
        • Justin Esarey, Rice University and The Political Methodologist
        • Gianluca Setti, University of Ferrara, Italy and IEEE
        • Joelle Lomax, Science Exchange

9:45am  Overview of the Workshop
        • Victoria Stodden, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign

10:15am Break

10:30am Case Studies
        Speakers:
        • Yoav Benjamini, Tel Aviv University
        • Justin Wolfers, University of Michigan

12:10pm Lunch

Session II - Conceptualizing, Measuring, and Studying Reproducibility

1:30pm  Definitions and Measures of Reproducibility
        Speaker: Steve Goodman, Stanford
        Discussant: Yoav Benjamini, Tel Aviv University

2:30pm  Reproducibility and “Statistical Significance”
        Speaker: Dennis Boos, North Carolina State University
        Discussants:
        • Andreas Buja, Wharton, University of Pennsylvania
        • Val Johnson, Texas A&M

3:30pm Break

3:45pm  Assessment of Factors Affecting Reproducibility
        Speaker: Marc Suchard, University of California, Los Angeles
        Discussants:
        • Courtney Soderberg, Center for Open Science
        • John Ioannidis, Stanford University
4:45pm Reproducibility from the Informatics Perspective  
*Speaker:* Mark Liberman, University of Pennsylvania  
*Discussant:* Micah Altman, Massachusetts Institute of Technology

5:45pm Adjourn

**Friday, February 27**

**Session III - The Way Forward: Using Statistics to Achieve Reproducibility**

8:30am Panel Discussion: Open Problems, Needs and Opportunities for Methodologic Research  
Moderator: Giovanni Parmigiani, Dana Farber Cancer Institute  
- Lida Anestidou, National Research Council  
- Tim Errington, Center for Open Science  
- Xiaoming Huo, National Science Foundation  
- Roger Peng, Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health

9:45am Break

10:00am Panel Discussion: Reporting Scientific Results and Sharing Scientific Study Data  
Moderator: Victoria Stodden, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign  
- Keith Baggerly, MD Anderson Cancer Center  
- Ron Boisvert, Association for Computing Machinery and National Institute of Standards and Technology  
- Randy LeVeque, Society for Industrial and Applied Mathematics and University of Washington  
- Marcia McNutt, Science

11:45am Panel Discussion: The Way Forward from the Data Sciences Perspective: Research  
Moderator: Constantine Gatsonis, Brown University  
- Chaitan Baru, National Science Foundation  
- Phil Bourne, National Institutes of Health  
- Rafael Irizarry, Harvard University  
- Jeff Leek, Johns Hopkins University

1:00pm Adjourn
Suggested Literature

Session I - Overview and Case Studies


Session II - Conceptualizing, Measuring, and Studying Reproducibility


Stodden, V. (2013). Resolving irreproducibility in empirical and computational research. IMS Bulletin Online,

Session III - The Way Forward: Using Statistics to Achieve Reproducibility


Stodden, V. (2013). Resolving irreproducibility in empirical and computational research. IMS Bulletin Online


Wicherts, J. M., Bakker, M., & Molenaar, D. (2011). Willingness to share research data is related to the strength of the evidence and the quality of reporting of statistical results. PloS One, 6(11), e26828.

Planning Committee

Co-Chairs

Constantine Gatsonis, Brown University
Giovanni Parmigiani, Dana Farber Cancer Institute

Members

Stephen Fienberg (NAS), Carnegie Mellon University
Steven N. Goodman, Stanford University School of Medicine
John H. Holmes, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine
Alan F. Karr, RTI International
Jelena Kovačević, Carnegie Mellon University
Xihong Lin, Harvard University
Roger Peng, Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health
Victoria Stodden, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign

Staff officer:
Michelle Schwalbe
mschwalbe@nas.edu
202.334.1682